Comparative Study on the Library Leadership between UIN Sunan Kalijaga and UII
(A Search for Human Resources, Financial Issues, and Collection Development)

Rusmiatiningsih

Nurdin

Abstract

The purpose of this paper is to find out a leadership comparison between two libraries of Islamic Universities, UIN Sunan Kalijaga and Indonesia Islamic University (UII). The scope of the paper is to identify power relations of the two libraries including three elements: human resources, financial issues, and collection development. The research uses qualitative descriptive method. It was conducted by a constructionist phenomenological approach using a cultural studies paradigm through a case study at two Islamic university libraries in Yogyakarta. The research finds some similarities on the element of human resources amongst both libraries. UII and UIN Sunan Kalijaga libraries have similar power relations on the employment including seniority, employment status, gender, and professional authority. Meanwhile, some differences in the power relations are found in the human resources in the practice of succession of leadership, recruitment culture, budget, and collection. UIN Sunan Kalijaga library has become stronger power relations which are influenced by religious and political ideology, than UII library.

Keyword: library leadership, concept of power, Islamic library, academic library, UIN Sunan Kalijaga, UII.

Background

State and private universities have historically had different institutional images with unique characteristics each. According to Handayani in Kusdiyanto (2008,p.151), public perception towards private universities has a second image after state universities. However this condition would provide motivation for private universities to improve their images by providing better services in various units. Currently, on infrastructure and services have been built to provide for their users.

According to Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia No.4, 2014, state universities were organized by the government. Meanwhile, private universities were held by communities (PP. RI No.4, 2014). Therefore, it can be concluded that the differences between state universities and private universities are located only on who have and finance. This point indicates that the position of the university libraries under state and private institutions have an equal opportunity to maximize their potentials, albeit different concepts and orientations depending on their institutional statuses. If so, it can be perceived that the success of university libraries is greatly influenced by those has the power. The power is not always interpreted as a figure of leadership. The practice of domination can be interpreted as a power which is spread in every line of society. Foucault states that the position of power does not always take place on individual or group but on everywhere on the structure of the invisible life (Barker, 2014, p.162).

Indonesia Islamic University (UII) and State Islamic University (UIN Sunan Kalijaga) are oldest Islamic institutions that have a similar complicated history. The history on the birth of Islamic Institutions in Indonesia is an initiative of reformist figure, politicians, scholars and Moslem intellectuals involved in Islamic

1 LIS Graduate Program, UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta - Indonesia, Email: rusmiatiningsih38@yahoo.com
2 LIS Graduate Program, UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta - Indonesia, Email: n.laugu@gmail.com
organizations. The establishment of Islamic universities as an Islamic symbolism is aimed at producing Islamic scholars in order that education in Indonesia is not dominated by nationalist based universities. The desire to establish Islamic Institution is not only concerning on ideological issues, but also relating to political and sociological aspect (Depag RI, 2003, P.43). The issue of ideology is the results of the battle of religious ideology which is going to dominate. Political issues are seen from the conflict between Islamists and nationalists. The strong position of Islam politically invites jealousy of others. The establishment of Islamic colleges in many places can be used as a means of consolidation and strengthening the position of Islam in the state. Meanwhile, sociological issues reflect that the gentry elites have greater opportunity to pursue higher education than the Islamists. As a result of this policy, the gentry elites are easier to mobilize and gain socioeconomic position. In this situation, awareness of Islamists that appears to establish colleges has become a representation of social structure mobility for training religious leaders.

Viewed from this phenomenon it seems that Islamic colleges were born on the dominant position, so that it is not impossible that the practice of dominations has become pervasive in various sectors, including libraries. Laugu follows the view of Foucalt’s concepts in his research that the management of university libraries is obviously affected by ideological games amongst ruling actors which then represented in managerial practices and library services (Laugu, 2015, p.224). Both libraries of Indonesian Islamic University (UII) and UIN Sunan Kalijaga have similarities as under Islamic institutions.

Their characteristics and uniqueness which are being taken into the library field are believed to involve the practice of power that spread amongst various corners of the system. Both universities, UII and UIN Sunan Kalijaga are under Islamic institutions that have a complex history. The complexity is that both universities in the beginning are one institution. Both are finally separated on the status, namely private and public. For those aspects, the libraries of UII and UIN Sunan Kalijaga become interesting to analyze because the flow of power is believed to occur and spread into the several aspects of the library.

Research Method

This study uses a qualitative and descriptive approach. Qualitative research is an approach method that is studied based on the natural phenomena, where researchers become a key instrument at research. Data validity is based on technique of collecting data sources which is a purposive and snowball sampling, gathering the data with triangulation, and data analysis is done inductively (Sugiyono, 2010, p.15). The result of the search emphasizes more on meaning than generalization. Meanwhile, according to Moleong (2007, p.247), qualitative research intends to understand the phenomena which are experienced by the subject of the study, such as behavior, perception, motivation, action, etc.

Descriptive study is aimed at measuring a certain social phenomena accurately. According to Singarimbun (2008, p.12-13), descriptive studies usually have two goals; to determine the development of certain physical and to describe the particular social phenomenon in detail. Additionally, Sukmadinata (2008, p.18) states that the descriptive research aims to define a situation of phenomenon as it is. From these explanations, the descriptive studies are concluded as a research which tries to explain about a particular phenomenon in the form of word and languages as it is systematically arranged.

Conceptual Apparatus

Leadership

Leadership is a process of creating a vision and doing interaction which mutually influences between a leader and his/her follower in order to realize the vision (Wirawan, 2013, p.7). According Aunur Rohim and IIP Wijayanto, leadership is a social problem in which an interaction occurs amongst led parties to achieve a common goal (Fakih, 2001, p.8). Thus, leadership is an activity of interaction between a leader and subordinates to work together to realize agreed goals. If implemented in a library, the leadership is an activity that takes place between the library leader and his/her staff in order to achieve the vision and missions of the library.
Library as a Power Field of Universities

According to Mitzberg, power is a concept for understanding how people influence each other in an organization (Gary Yulk, 2010, p.172). Kotler states that power is an ability to influence others to get something (Mocus Gonzalves, 2013). This is also in line with what is presented by Kumaran about criteria that must be possessed by a leader. Some of them are determining a direction, giving motivation, deciding goals, and making a policy. Leaders can be found at all levels of organization. A leader is a good manager but not all managers are leaders (Supreme Kumaran, 2012, p.157).

Furthermore, the power in an organization always contains idealist elements in order to influence people so that they can work together to achieve the vision of the organization. Dawam Raharjo states that a university is basically an idealist institution which is nonprofit. In addition to acting as a printer for cadres of nation and society, it also plays a role for preserving certain values that are sublime. Universities have a concept of values. Therefore, the values can be fundamental or developed as a scientific concept, a particular religion or school of thought, and/or mahzhab a particular movement. Thus, the values fought for are relatively fixed albeit can be adaptive or flexible (Izwar Annas, 1993).

According to Merry in Harris (1995, p.5), other than finding books, a library serves as a manager of knowledge and information, which puts it as a symbol of intellectual power and politics. Such situation can be seen in the symbols, like titles and sertificates of education achieved from universities to show actors’ position in social relation (Richard Hughes, 2012, p.177). In relation to that, the conception of Bourdeu can be used to analyze libraries, museums, and information centers which focus more on information services as a way of encouraging them to meet the need or a large community. This issue includes a wide variety of communities with different orientations toward culture, education, and office or government organizations (Lisa, 2010, p.48).

Lisa Husey believes that the LIS (Library and Information Science) focuses on delivering a service that could play a round as a tool to act as an amplifier that may strengthen the presence of social structures to enter the practice of coercion and injustice. Library servives not only become a tool to build a symbolic power and capitalist culture, but also play a significant role in the arena of cultural production, acting as a facilitator and preservation agent or repository of culture. Library as a part of the government or educational institutions often acts as a legitimacy of cultural objects. The library is a place to find and read books, as well as do research, which gives an impression of the perception of the available resources.

This issue has become an important focus arena for power struggles and the interests of capital needed to affect (Lisa, 2010, p.49). Similar to this point, Laugu (2015, p.23) states that a library is an arena of representation of power which is seen in the activities of the library. John Bud and Anne Goulding in (2010, P.49) view that the role of the library as a producer, which is institutionalized has disseminated and built a capitalist culture and symbolic power that can be identified in the library role regarding the collection of artifacts, cultures and other related elements. Goulding argues that the library is used as an indicator of cultural capital, suggesting that libraries can be regarded as a site for the production, dissemination, and appropriation of cultural capital. Meanwhile, Budd judges that there is unconsciousness or unacknowledgment that symbolic power has been used in the library policies and practices, which create a limitation of consideration on interpretive ethics of social action. Although both have different points of view, both expressed a clear analysis of the library and its role as a cultural reproducer. Even, both give a perception that the library as a prominent figure in cultural production. In this case it is not to question the role of the library that has spread capitalist culture but to see how the position of the library in a social group (Hussey, 2010, p.49).

The Scope of Leadership in Libraries

Henry Fayol mentioned that elements of management are; man, money, material, and method. In a library, man element includes those who are called as human resources, such as head of the library, librarian, and staff. Element of money, is called as a library budget. This budget is an element of library management which is important to drive activities of the library. The next is a material one which includes a variety of facilities and infrastructure to support the management activities. Method is a way or system used to conduct activities.
Discussion

A Glance on the Leadership of Library of UII

Human Resources

In the human resource, power concept of library can be viewed from hierarchical structure, recruitment culture, and professional authority for each actor in the library. In this structure, power representation is reflected in aspects of director successions, between staff, seniority, employment status, and gender issues.

At the highest structure of the library, the power is held by the head of the library. UII library is led by a person, which is called as director. The director is appointed by rector. In the election of the director, UII library has become an arena of power representation which is a temporary perspective. Laugu (2015, p.119) states that this occurs only at the election of the leader, by which religious ideology is not involved in such situation. UII communities have believed that the elected leaders must be from professionals who are considered to be able to develop their organization. In such situation, UII library seems to have a power model that tends to be controlled by the idea of professionalism rather than primordialism. The flows of temporary power have been incarnated into a force which is used for electing a leader who is considered to have a commitment for winning a rector at the university. This can be referred to an evident from the statements of several informants as follow:

“Thus,… the selection of library director is conducted every four years after rector succession. The candidate of the library director is appointed by rector elected because he/she is regarded as a person who has contributed toward rector election. However, every library candidate must be having capabilities and competences in leadership skill and/or library science. In the election process, there seems an emotional situation albeit can be solved through professional approach in the election process. Finally, all of them work as usual and as if nothing happens before.” (Conducted on January, 11, 2017)."

It is also found that relations between staff which have reflected seniority in UII library are not from power of individuals, but institutional power in the form of organizational commands. In the aspect of employment status, the library as a private institution employs two types of employee position, namely permanent and nonpermanent (contract). Power relations found in those types of position seem that permanent employees are more dominating and respected than those nonpermanent ones. Meanwhile, from gender perspectives aspect, such relations can be seen in the context of employee number. Male number is higher than female number albeit it is not being a question for power relation in gender issues.

Furthermore, the flow of power in the human resource element seems as only tradition and custom practiced by UII library in the recruitment process. The process has been done in a professional way through two approaches, internal and external. Internal approach, is a recruitment which is open only to nonpermanent staff (contract) among UII staff. Meanwhile, external approach is a vacancy which is open to public. The vacancy can be followed by all those who are interested. Both approaches use the same model, including written, oral, skill, religious practice and library science tests. In internal approach, track records covering devotion and loyalty of applicants during their contract performance are highly emphasized. It is found that the way of recruitment in UII library is purely to improve the professionalism of librarianship competency standards. Power relations in other human resource element are located in the professional authority. This authority is utilized amongst librarians for preserving the culture of learning together (sharing knowledge). Such situation creates a synergetic atmosphere which is benefit for avoiding the arrogance of scientific authority. This environment has been practiced by the library which has prioritized a solidarity of teamwork and tried to minimize any individual arrogance.
Comparative Study on the Library Leadership between UIN Sunan Kalijaga and UII

Budget (Financial issues)

Budgetary has become an important aspect in an organization. Whatever good for any planning in an activity if not supported by enough budget, then it will be difficult to achieve maximum results. UII library under private institutions indicates that all its budgets are determined by the university. Nonetheless, the library is given a freedom to plan its annual budget. This phenomenon can be seen in the words of an informant in following:

“Our sources of budget are from university that comes from tuition fee (SPP), business development, endowments, grants, and cooperation. No other sources except gifts of collection from national library and UII students. While, income of fines from overdue of returning collection is reported to rector. UII library plans its budget through work plan for annual budget, called as RKAT. The library has a planning team which is led by its director with the assistants of five heads of divisions as team members. The team membership aims to represent activities of those division. The director serves as a supervisor for the activities of the team. As far as I know there is no negotiation between library and university when the results of the annual budget plan are submitted. The rector seems that he knows what is important and not. It also seems that he is not emotional encountering many situation (conducted on January, 11, 2017)”

Referred to the above statement, it can be interpreted that the library as a private institution relies much on private management by UII. The budget sources come from tuition fee (donation education management), business development, endowments, government grants, and cooperation with domestic and overseas institutions. In the aspect of this budget, it can be concluded that power relations occur in the concept of library finding that is totally decided by rector. Nevertheless, the library is given an authority to plan its own programs which spend the budget itself. The authority is used in the work plan for annual budget. Therefore, in this work plan, discussion about the budget has become more effective and conducive to achieve library goals as indicated in the planned program. This situation creates a peaceful and conducive atmosphere without any emotional tension in negotiating the budget request.

Collection

Currently, collection developed by UII library is a digital collection such as e-book and e-journal. Meanwhile, its printed collections are developed from student donation. The subjects of collections developed are based on those which support study programs and religions studies. The subjects that are influenced by pluralist and non-pluralist movement can be seen from OPAC searches albeit in a reasonable limit. In the collection development, a plan is determined by RKAT. The budget can be planned used every month, even day. Collection acquisition at the library is done without an auction system in order to avoid misuse of funds. In addition to using its own budget, some collections are obtained from foreign grants, such as Saudi Arabia and students who are going to get a free loan letter from library (Laugu, 2015, p.137). This can be seen from the information submitted by informant as follows:

“collection developed by the library is equally allocated for all majors. Because of the library budget from university, the mechanism of purchasing collection can be done at any time whenever needed. Proposal submitted to university is usually approved about 50%. Expenditure for e-journal collection is usually higher than other collections. Collection development for our library is conducted by the library itself under control by the head of the acquisition division.” (conducted on January, 11, 2017)

Referred to this interview, it is clear that the system of collection development in the library works more effective and efficient because it is directed to fulfill the needs of library users. It seems better than the auction system involving multiple parties with a strict procedure but potential in individual interest.

A Glance of Leadership at UIN Sunan Kalijaga Library

Human Resources

In the succession of the head of UIN Sunan Kalijaga library, power relations occur in the from of religious groups. The power relations come from the parent institution. Ideological competition is represented by the
groups of NU and Muhammadiyah as social religious organization. This competition emerges in every successions of the university to the faculty (Laugu, 2015, p.137). This phenomenon influences the leadership of the library. Another word, the library cannot free from intervention of both ideologies in terms of its leadership. The rector has become an actor who chooses and determines the person who will be the head of the library. In line with this issue, the power that is reflected in the relationship between staff of the libraries can be seen from seniority practices which take place in the interaction of communication in their daily work. Such practices are rather to establish an harmonious relationship amongst them. It is the same in their employment status as seen between civil servants and non civil servants (Laugu, 2015, p.139). It seems usual that the position of permanent employees or civil servants have a clear staffing legitimacy.

This phenomenon influences their materialistic performances which indicate as having economic status which is more powerful than nonpermanent (contract) staff. From this situation, it can be concluded that good economic backgrounds have become a determinant factor in power relation.

In the aspect of gender issue, UIN Sunan Kalijaga library has employed 44 persons that are more female in number than male. The 44 employees consist of 24 female and 20 male. At this point, a problem sometimes arises when there is an effort to increase the number of male employees as a way of advocating men against the number of women because for several reason. The main reason is that the women are still regarded as persons who have abilities under men. Besides, power effects also flow on the culture of recruitment. UIN Sunan Kalijaga library as an institution under state government agency has not become a strange thing if the recruitment process is found a sort of dynastic elements. According to Laugu (2015, p.129), the recruitment processes of UIN Sunan Kalijaga library have been potentially producing human resources which are inclined into a dynastic culture. However, currently the recruitment activity has been more openly albeit in the practices that still seem to rely on “close relationship” than professional competence. This is evident from the overall employees of UIN Sunan Kalijaga library in which it is found a kinship relations amongst them.

In the case of professional authority, librarians of UIN Sunan Kalijaga have understood the importance of professionalism through the realizations of library mission. It is also found that some of the employees of UIN Sunan Kalijaga library are not from library education, but they are considered as staff who have good competence in library practice because of their long field experiences. Even though, the staff with library education is regarded as a person who has theoretical competences which are much higher than others. Therefore, they are expected to be more convincing a scientific authority. This situation sometimes causes a bit problem but finally the situation is quickly under control. The member of the staff have become aware that professionalism and competences need wisdom as a foundation for all kinds of relationship.

Financial Issues
UIN Sunan Kalijaga library under a state university can be understood that its budget is dependent on government allocation. The main source of the library budget stems from state revenue and expenditure budget (APBN). In addition, the budget is backup up by tuition fee, called SPP (Donation of Development of Education), business development center, and cooperation. It is found that the budget mechanism and process which are sometimes complicated influence the activities of the library. The influence tends to create problems because certain programs can be cancelled due to the certain budget. This situation extremely affects the activities of the library.

Collection
Collection development activities are conducted once a year following the budget mechanism. The acquisition of collection at UIN Sunan Kalijaga library uses an auction process. This process involves many parties, which sometimes subordinate library element. The auction process indicates power relations which can be seen from the position of the auction winner that sometimes determines collection. Therefore, this auction practice may cause anxiety for library because it is often used by certain parties for personal benefit. Ultimately, procurement activities are not effective because they are not oriented to the needs of users.
Furthermore, UIN Sunan Kalijaga library is known as a library that has been controlled by pluralist actors. Therefore, such actors can appreciate differences and seek to provide spaces and rooms for all forms of practices and school of thought without having a tendency to control one of these groups (Laugu, 2015, p.133).

This is reflected in the presence of corners which provide liberal collections, such as Canadian and Iranian corner collections. Power points can be seen pluralist and non pluralist thoughts. In Laugu research, it shows the power concepts through a research for OPAC (Online Public Catalog) searches. It is found that the power flow of pluralist and nonpluralist is represented very high in the titles of books belong to UIN Sunan Kalijaga library (Laugu, 2015, p.142).

**Comparative Analysis**

Both UII and UIN Sunan Kalijaga libraries have their own characteristic each. Uniqueness is the result of practice of power that spreads in some aspects of the library. In the practice of the power of the libraries, both have some similarities and differences.

The similarities take place on the human resource and collection development elements. In the human resource element, it can be seen in the relationship including seniority, employment status, gender, and professional authority. In the relationship between staff, seniority is regarded as a local wisdom tradition practiced in both libraries. In terms of the employment status, both libraries have similar points in which civil servants or permanent staff are higher than nonpermanent (contract). This is because the social structure factor of society has formed the mindset that a confession is located on the legality of the public eye.

Furthermore, on the issue of gender, both libraries have not made this issue as a serious problem because both types of female and male employees are equally required in both libraries. Lori Ricigliano and Renne Housten address gender issues that “in libraries, occupational segregation divides traditional library departments and functions from IT departments and technology applications. Librarians are predominantly female and, as the occupational statistic show, IT workers are predominantly male. The result for libraries has been a gendered segregation of the library workforce”. Adam also reveals that in an organization culture, men are more often associated with IT positions, while women are more likely to be associated positions in the large-scale groups in an organization, and not specifically on IT (Lamont, 2009, p.140). This gives a clear view that why women become more dominant because they more often occupy public positions than positions that require specialized skills, such as IT. UII library with dominant males shows that the orientation is being changed to sheer achievement of organizational effectiveness with emphasis on competency standards, while UIN Sunan Kalijaga library is trying to advocate a balance of orientation between male and female.

The last similarity is the authority of the profession. The librarians of UII and UIN Sunan Kalijaga have gradually realized the importance of academic competences in supporting their profession. As a consequence, both libraries try to create a culture of sharing and learning amongst them. This culture is expected to produce a culture of mutual understanding, which is held to reduce the conflict of individual egoism.

Beside of the similarities, it is also found several differences between those libraries. These differences occur on the elements of human resources, budget and collections. In the human resources, the differences take place at the successions and recruitment culture. In the succession issue, UIN Sunan Kalijaga library is extremely influenced by religious ideology, while UII library is not influenced by that ideology, but it is influenced by the picture of figures who are considered professionals. This kind of power relation has been occurred because UIN Sunan Kalijaga library is under government affairs which are open to a variety of religious perspective. Different things happen in UII library that is oriented to professional competence. Then, in the cultural aspects of recruitment, UII library uses a method that is more open comparing to UIN Sunan Kalijaga library. It is again influenced by institutional elements. UIN Sunan Kalijaga library under government institution tends to practice the culture of dynastic profession that has occurred since the beginning, while the UII library is a private institution that has built a clean culture for the recruitment of staff in order to get competitive human resources.
The next striking differences are the budget and collection development. UIN Sunan Kalijaga library relies much on the state revenue and expenditure budget (APBN) so that its activities of planning and implementation look too biereuacratic and not free as well as reflected in the procurement of the collection using an auction process. This technique is vulnerable to enter political interest and to enrich individuals. Meanwhile, the library of UI which is under private institution looks easier to manage its budget, so that it can become more flexible because not requiring a long bureaucratic process. Therefore, it is found that its collection development can work more effective because the budget can be spent any time whenever needed to fulfil the needs of the user.

Conclusion

Power relations have been pervasive into library elements, such as in the human resources, financial issues, and collection development. The concept of power is equally found in both libraries of UII and UIN Sunan Kalijaga. Similarities in both libraries have been seen in the element of the human resource. Both libraries have power relations on the seniority, employment status, gender, and professional authority. Meanwhile, differences between both libraries can be seen in the leadership election, recruitment culture, budget, and collection development. UIN Sunan Kalijaga library leadership on one hand is still influenced by religious ideology. It is different in what happens in UII library that is more affected by professionalism. UII library as a private institution looks more professional and open concerning on the process of recruitment, budgeting, and collection development. In contrast to UIN Sunan Kalijaga library under a state institution, its process of recruitment, budgeting, and collection development seem to be more traditional. It means that some elements still become a barrier in library development, such as dynastic profession, long bureaucracy, and budgets of complicated auction process that involve many parties and interests. Finally, such situation produces an image that libraries under private institution become more dynamic than those under state institutions.

References


