# **REFORMISTS' THOUGHT ON THE SUNNA**

(A Comparative Study on Moenawwar Chalil's and Fazlur Rahman's

**Principles of the Sunna)** 



### A THESIS SUBMITTED TO FACULTY OF ISLAMIC THEOLOGY IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR OBTAINING BACHELOR DEGREE OF ISLAMIC THEOLOGY

BY:

MUHAMMAD JULKARNAIN SN: 07530068

SUPERVISOR: INAYAH ROHMANIYAH, S.Ag, M.Hum, M.A.

DEPARTMENT OF TAFSIR AND HADIS FACULTY OF ISLAMIC THEOLOGY, STUDY OF RELIGION AND ISLAMIC THOUGHT SUNAN KALIJAGA STATE ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY YOGYAKARTA

2011

#### DECLARATION

Name	Muhammad Julkarnain		
Student Number	07530068		
Faculty	: Islamic Theology, Religious Studies and Islamic		
	Thought		
Department	: Tafsir and Hadith		
Home Address	: Samarinda Seberang, Rt. 23, Kec. Loa Janan Ilir,		
	Kalimantan-Timur.		
Address in Yogyakarta	: PP. Aji Mahasiswa Al-Muhsin, Parangtritis		
	Street KM. 3,5 Krapyak Wetan Sewon Bantul		
Telp/Hp	: 01347716706		
Topic	: REFORMISTS'S THOUGHT ON THE		
	SUNNA (A COMPARATIVE STUDY ON		
	MOENAWWAR CHALIL'S AND FAZLUR		
	RAHMAN'S PRINCIPLES OF THE SUNNA)		

Declared that:

I :

- 1. The thesis I submitted is original and I wrote it myself.
- 2. If the thesis is examined and then must be revised, I am ready to revise it in two months, from the examination date. If revision is not finished in two months, I am ready to be declared as failed and the thesis will be defended by self funding.
- 3. If the thesis was identified as plagiatory later, I will accept sanctions and my degree will be cancelled.

I made this statement with full consciousness. Thanks.

Yogyakarta, June 14, 2011 signed, 3C4D4AAF402461867 6000 Muhammad Julkarnain SN: 07530068

#### Inayah Rohmaniyah, S.Ag, M. Hum, MA.

The Lecturer of Faculty of Islamic Theology Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University

Yogyakarta

**OFFICIAL NOTE** 

Matter : The Thesis of Muhammad Julkarnain

Honorable: **The Dean of Faculty of Islamic Theology Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University** in - Yogyakarta

### Assalamu'alaikum wr. wb.

After having read, researched, and corrected to whatever extent is necessary, we, as supervisor, think that the thesis belonging:

Name	: MUHAMMAD JULKARNAIN
Student Number	: 07530068
Department	: Tafsir and Hadis
Title	: REFORMISTS' THOUGHT ON SUNNA (a
	Comparative Study on Moenawwar Chalil's and
	Fazlurrahman's Principles of Sunna)

could be submitted in a partial fulfilment of requirements to obtain a bachelor degree in Islamic Theology. Thus, it could be immediately defended.

AKAR

Thank you very much for your understanding.

Wassalamu'alaikum wr. wb.

Yogyakarta, June 15, 2011

Supervisor,

Inayah Rohmaniyah, S.Ag. M. Hum, MA. OIN. 19711019 199603 2 001 Faculty of Islamic Theology, Study of Religion and Islamic Thought Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University Yogyakarta

FM-UINSK-PBM-05-07/RO

### APPROVAL PAGE No: UIN.02/DU/PP.00.9/ 98/2011

The Thesis Entitle: REFORMISTS' THOUGHT ON THE SUNNA (A<br/>COMPARATIVE STUDY ON MOENAWWAR<br/>CHALIL'S AND FAZLUR RAHMAN'S PRINCIPLE<br/>OF THE SUNNA)Name: Muhammad JulkarnainStudent Number: 07530068Was defended on: June 27, 2011Score:  $94 (A^{-})$ has been approved by Faculty of Islamic Theology, Study of Religion and Islamic Thought,

has been approved by Faculty of Islamic Theology, Study of Religion and Islamic Thought, Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University.

**Defend Committee** Chair Inayah Rohmaniyah, S.Ag, M.Hum, MA. SEN. 19711019 199603 2001 Examiner I Examiner II Dr. phil. Sahiron Syamsuddin, MA Drs. H. Mohamad Yusup, M.Si. SEN: 19680605 199403 1 003 SEN: 19600207 199403 1 001 Yogyakarta, June 27, 2011 The Dean of Faculty of Islamic Theology Study of Religion and Islamic Thought Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University Yogyakarta Svaifan Nur, MA. SEN: 19620718 199803 1 005

# ΜΟΤΤΟ

إن معالعسريسر ا

(Q.S. Al-Insyirah: 6)

برميمذيله مكا توحان اكن مملوك ميمذي ميمذيمو

(Arai)

# STATE ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY

"Reformology" is Solution on Redesigning Islam universalism

(Muhammad Zulkarnain)

This paper is completely dedicated to:

# My Father and Mother:

My beloved *mama* Hj. Noordiana (alm) in Heaven who always advised me: *Jadilah ikam urang baiman nak!*," and also my beloved *Abah* H. Mursani and my mother (Nur Jannah) who always teach me how to thank God.

# My Brother:

For my great *abang* (M. Fitriadi), Thank for your experiences that you gave to me.

# My Sisters:

For My beloved *adings* Nur Amaliah (alm) and Nur Solehah, *Jadilah wanita sholehah yang sesungguhnya*, be more than your brothers.

#### Abstract

It is interesting to discuss about reformist as an advocate of reform and reinterpreting religious norms and sources, including the Sunna. The reformists' ideology had been inviting internal conflicts in Indonesian Muslim context bacause of the resistance from traditionalists. The significance of this research is to analyze the reformists's thoughts to find the best method on understanding the Sunna. Researcher investigates three research questions including the main thoughts of Moenawwar Chalil's and Fazlur Rahman's on Sunna principles, the similiarities and differences, and the strengths and weaknesses of their thoughts. From this research question, the reformist's thought on Sunna principles will be found.

This is library research which will explain about reformists' thoughts on Sunna. The primary sources for this reasearch are *Kembali Kepada Al-Qur'an dan As-Sunnah (Back to the Qur'an and Sunna)*, and *Islamic Methodology in History*. The secondary sources include *Modern reformist Thought In The Muslim World, Paham Keagamaan Kaum Reformis: Studi Kasus Pemikiran Moenawar Chalil (Religious Understanding of Reformists: Study of Moenawwar Chalil's Thought)*. The Method of collecting of data is documentation , while the technique of data analyses are historical continuity, taxonomic analyses, interpretation and comparation. This research uses hermeneutical approach. This hermeneutical approach is inspired by Hasan Hanafi which focus on three steps: *historical consciousnesss (al-Shu'ūr al-Tārikhī*) that determines the originality the text and certainty, *eidetic consciousness (al-Shu'ūr al-'Amalī*) as a basic theory for practical applications. Hassan Hanafi's theory is used to classify reformists' thought.

Research shows that Chalil's historical criticism is dominated by Islamic jurisprudence perspectives. His reform ideas are addressed to redesign the legal characters based on Sunna. Chalil believes that Sunna and its mission to advance Islam can be achieved by conserving the essences of Sunna. In the other hand, Fazlur Rahman believes that the prophetic Sunna must be interpreted in line with modernity without neglecting the historical factors. Chalil and Rahman do not focus on *sanad* criticism. They try to put Sunna in the highest position and applicable in the Muslim societies. Chalil and Rahman are different on their method to understand the Sunna. Practically, Chalil is successful in producing *fiqh al-Nabawī* althought without integrating modern sciences. He understands Sunna based on textual approach method by letting texts explains each other. This is Chalil's weakness when compared to Rahman who contextualizes the Sunna rationally using interdisciplinary approaches. With this method Rahman tries to find the ideal-moral of Sunna.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENT

بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

الحمد لله الذى أنزل على عبده الكتاب ولم يجعل له عوجا. وجعله للناس فى دنياهم وأخراهم منهجا. فمن أخذه إماما فقد نجا. ومن وضعه مأموما فقد هوى. وصلاة الله وسلامه على أسوتنا محمد خير المهدى, الذي ترك لنا كتاب الله وسنته إن تمسكتا بهما فلن نضل أبدا. وعلى أله وصحبه والتابعين دستوره وسلوكه جميعا

All praise and glory always be to Allah, the only owner of greatness, glory, and majesty, who grants mercy, guidance, and forgiveness to all of us although we forget to ask, so we could keep the faith, Islam, and Ihsan, as well as commitment as young generation to always be thirsty for knowledge.

Invocation and peace hopely always be poured to Prophet Muhammad SAW, along with his family, friends, and people who grasp adamantly and firmly to the teachings he had brought up to the end of time.

This thesis is structured to meet the final assignment given by Faculty of Islamic Theology as one of many conditions that must be met to obtain a bachelor degree on the field of Islamic Theology.

I realize that the thesis could not be structured thoroughly and completely without any support, guidance, and prayer from the people around, who gave wisdom and experience to me so far. Therefore, I rightly have to thank to:

- 1. My father and mother: H. Mursani and Hj. Noordiana (alm.) and Nurjannah my beloved parents who always support and pray for my succesful.
- Syaikh Muhammad Nafis al-Banjari, Guru Sekumpul Martapura, Kai Matseh (alm) And Nenek Masway, Kai Norman and Nenek Nur Asih (alm), Nenek Aluh Lina. I took wisdoms from you.
- 3. My beloved brothers and sisters: *Bang* Ipit and Ani, I hope you become a *sakinah*, *mawaddah* and *Rahmah* family, Amin. My beloved and funny *adings*: Nur Sholehah, and Nur Amaliyah (alm), I challenge you to be greatest people like our father. Together we make our father and mother proud of us. *Bermimipilah maka Tuhan akan memeluk mimpi-mimpimu ding*! My Nephews who coloured my days: Icha, Fauzi, Nazril, Hairi Mandasta, Rahma, Najwa, Zaka, Aida and All. Together we change the world!.
- 4. Ministry of Religious Affairs who gave me opportunity and scholarship to continue my study at Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University.
- My Pesantren " PPKP. Ribathul Khail" Timbau-Kutai Kartanegara and its staff that thaught me arabic words and Islamic bases.
- 6. My Pesantren "Al-Mujahidin" Rapak Dalam, Samarinda Seberang and its staff that gave me opportunity to know the wisdom. Especially to *Pak* Rasyid and *Pak* Imam Syafi'i as Pesantren Mujahidin's foundation adviser who gives me chance to study in Java. It is my academic work *pak*.
- Dr. Syaifan Nur, MA as Dean of Faculty of Islamic Theology at Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University and his staff.

- 8. Prof. Dr. Suryadi, M. Ag as Chairman of Department of Tafsir and Hadis and his staff.
- 9. Inayah Rohmaniyah, S.Ag, MA, as my supervisor who always support, motivate, and provide direction and guidance in the preparation of this thesis. You shown me the way to be better *Bu*.
- 10. Dr. Abdul Mustaqim as who guided in education time.
- 11. My beloved roommate: Mas Triji, Mas Badruz, and Gortal who always and all friends in "Theo Rangers" : Apit, Kempip, Kaji Mus'id (Wagiman), Syihab, Salim, Dyan, Fadhli, Kobet, Aank Arif, The Max, Sunadhy, Dewi, Dyah, Marlintung (Miss Preeett), Gyanti, Zulfa, Joeha, Isti, Joejoe, Najmi, Ruroh, and all my best friends in who always be in my life.
- 12. My uncles: Om Udin and Acil Ilah, Om Tari dan Acil Iham, Om Sani and Acil Yanti, Om Yani and Acil Mala, Om Ramli and Acil Puah, Abah Nanda and Acil Lina, Om Isar and Teh Aisyah thank for your support. I hope God gives you blessing and prosperity.
- 13. Ma. Al-Mujahidin's Garduates of exacta program at 2007: Manda (calmest men), Amat Kahoi, Mizi (alm), Amin, Lutfi waluh, Yanti, Sinah, Emot, Mahrita, Cici, Fitriyani, Vitri Wahyuni, Datul. IPS's boys: Mail Tile, Udin Palu, Yani Bugis, Anshor Bone.
- 14. My bussines friend: *Makarima Corp*.(Anwar dan Fadholi), Zoehelmy (success for your *Pujangga Batik*), 'Atho, thanks for inspiration to!.
- 15. Heny Fatmawati who supports and prays for my succesfull. Barakallahu lak..

- 16. All friends in CSS MoRA. Together, we can change civilization!
- 17. My sisters and brothers *Ka Nisa* and *Dik Lia*, Atul, Munirah, Ita, Najib who always support me to finish this thesis. Thank for inspirations. Do the best, *Semangatmu bisa ku andalkan*!

I also realize that this thesis is less perfect and more deficient, so that I hope the readers would be prepared to render suggestion, advice, and wise critique to patch insufficient part in this thesis. Eventually, may this thesis can be savoured to improved treasure of Islamic knowledge. Amin.

Yogyakarta, April 14, 2011

Muhammad Julkarnain SIN: 07530068

STATE ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY SUNAN KALIJAGA Y O G Y A K A R T A

### TRANSLITERATION

This thesis uses the transliteration's system of American Library Association/ Library of Congress.

Letters of The Alphabet

Letter	Romanization	Letter	Romanization
١	omitted	ض	Ģ
ب	В	ط	ţ
ت	Т	ظ ظ	Ż
ڭ	Th	e	'(ayn)
ى	J	غ \	gh
7	h	ف	f
ż	kh	ق	q
د	D	زى	k
ć	dh	J	1
ر	R	Ą	m
j <sub>ct م</sub>			n n
			W
ش	Sh	ALJA	h
ص	<b>)</b> G <sub>s</sub> Y A	R کي R	ГАу

# Vowels and Dipthongs

= a	$\tilde{V} = \bar{a}$	ī= َ <b>ي</b>
_= i	á = أ	aw = e
ء = u	ق = تو	ay = آ <b>ی</b>

#### General Rules

- 1. Hyphen is used to connect the definite article *al* with the following word; between an inseparable prefix and the following word; between *bin* and the following word in personal names when they are written in Arabic as a single word.
- 2. Prime (') is used to resolve disambiguity, e.g. أكرمتها Ad'ham أدهم Ad'ham أكرمتها Ad'ham أدهم Akramat'hā. to mark the use of a letter in its final form when it occurs in the middle of a word, e.g. قلعة جي, Qal'ah'jī, شيخ زده, Syaikh'zādah.
- 3. ابن are both romanized *ibn*, except in modern names, typically North African, in which بن is romanized bin.
- 4. *Hamzah* in initial position is not romanized; when medial or final it is romanized ', e.g. مسألة, *mas'alah*, خطئ, *khați'a*.
- 5. *Tā' marbūṭah*: In a word in the construct state: *t*, e.g. وزارة التربية *Wizārat al-Tarbīyah*; in an indefinite noun or adjective or proceeded by the defnite article: *h*, e.g. الرسالة البهية, *al-Risālah al-bahīyah*.
- 6. The definite article is always romanized *al*-, whether is it followed by a "sun letter" or not. An exception is the preposition *J* followed by the article: *lil*-, e.g. للشربيني, *lil-Shirbīnī*.
- 7. Initial  $\bar{1}$  is romanized  $\bar{a}$ ; medial  $\bar{1}$  is romanized  $\bar{a}$ , when it represents the phonetic combination, e.g. تأليف,  $ta'\bar{a}l\bar{l}f$ ; otherwise  $\bar{1}$  is not romanized different from  $\bar{1}$ , e.g. خلفآء, *Khulafā'*.
- 8. *Tanwīn* is not normally romanized. For exceptions see *ALA-LC Romanization Tables*.
- 9.  $\tilde{g}$  representing the combination of long vowel plus consonant, is romanized  $\bar{u}w$ .

- 10. Medial يَّب representing the combination of long vowel plus consonant, is romanized *īy*; final يَ نَعْ is romanized *ī.* e.g. المصرية, *al-Miṣrī, al-Miṣrī, al-Miṣrīyah.*
- 11. *Shaddah* or *tashdīd* is romanized by doubling the letter.
- 12. <sup>1</sup> (*waṣlah*), is not romanized. When *alif* with *waṣlah* is part of the article لل, the initial vowel of the article is romanized *a*. In other words beginning with *hamzat al-waṣl*, the initial vowel is romanized *i*. E.g. باهتمام عبد المجيد, bi-ihtimām 'Abd al-Majīd.



TABLE	OF	CONTENT

TITLE PAGE	
DECLARATION	
SUPERVISOR'S OFFICIAL NOTE	
THESIS VALIDATION	iv
MOTTO PAGE	v
DEDICATION PAGE	vi
TRANSLITERATION	vii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT.	X
ABSTRACT	xiv
TABLE OF CONTENTS	XV
CHAPTER I. INTRODUCTION	
A. Background	1
B. Research Question	9
C. Research Objectives	9
D. Review of Literature	10
E. Research Method	13
F. Research Outline	16
CHAPTER II. GENERAL OVERVIEW OF REFORMIST	
A. Definition of Reformist	18
B. Historical Background of Refomist	20
C. Reformist on Sunna Discourse	26

# CHAPTER III. BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH OF MOENAWWAR CHALIL

## AND FAZLUR RAHMAN

A. Biography of Moenawwar Chalil	31
1. Socio-Cultural Background	31
2. Scholarly Career	32
3. Scholarly Works and Social Organizations Activities	33
B. Biography of Fazlur Rahman	54
1. Socio-Cultural Background	54
2. Scholarly Career	56
3. Scholarly Works and Social Organizations Activities	60
CHAPTER IV. THE COMPARISON ON MOENAWWAR CHALIL'S AND	
FAZLUR RAHMAN'S PRINCIPLES OF THE SUNNA	
A. Moenawwar Chalil's Principles on the Sunna	71
1. Moenawwar Chalil's Historical Criticism	71
2. Moenawwar Chalil's Eidetic Criticism	74
a. Comparing with the Qur'ān	74
b. Comparing with the variety of <i>riwayahs</i>	77
3. Moenawwar Chalil's Practical Criticism	80
a. Values	84
b. Significances	86
B. Fazlur Rahman's principles on the Sunna	90
1. Fazlur Rahman's Historical Criticism	90
a. Sunna in Informal phase	92
b. Sunna in Semi-Formal Phase	96

c. Sunna in Formal Phase	96
2. Fazlur Rahman's Eidetic Criticism	99
a. Sunna Historical Analysis	99
b. The systematic Interpretation Method	102
3. Fazlur Rahman's Practical Criticism	107
a. Values	107
b. Significances	109
C. Simmilarities and Differences	114
D. Strengths And Weaknesses	115
CHAPTER V. CONCLUSION	
A. Conclusion	122
B. Recommendation	123
BIBLIOGRAPHY	125
CURRICULUM VITAE	134

STATE ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY SUNAN KALIJAGA Y O G Y A K A R T A

#### CHAPTER I

#### INTRODUCTION

#### A. Background

The interpretation of Muslim religious sources is a crucial element in the development of reformism.<sup>1</sup> Sunna has an important role, as a second source in Islam. It functions as an explanatory (*al-Bayān*)<sup>2</sup> to the Qur'ān statements still globally. Every Muslim is aware of the importance of the Sunna, although the Hadith and Sunna definitively are different, but they can not be separated.<sup>3</sup>

Reformists tend to believe that problems in Muslim societies resulted from Muslims mistakes on understanding Islamic doctrines and rejections to implement principles of the Qur'an and the Sunna comprehensivelly. Reformist claimed that calling back to the Qur'an and Sunna as a primary doctrines of reformists as a sollution to these problems. They recognized that the ways to interpret the Qur'an and Sunna<sup>4</sup> idealistically as applied the prophet and *salaf* 

<sup>1</sup> Aziz al-Azmeh, *Islams and Modernities* (New York : Verso, 1996), p. 101.

<sup>2</sup> Hasjim Abbas, *Kritik Matan Hadis Versi Muhadditsin dan Fuqaha* (Yogyakarta: Teras, 2004), p. 1.

<sup>3</sup> Translator's introduction in Mustafa al-Siba'i, *Sunnah Dan Perkembangan Dalam Penetapan Hukum Islam: Sebuah Pembelaan Kaum Sunni* trans.Nurcholish Madjid (Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1991), p. VIIII.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Associated with Muhammad 'Abduh and his student Muhammad rashid Ridha, who remained faithful to the open-minded modernism of his teacher until a few years after the Imam's premature death in 1905. As was the case with all religious thought confronting overwhelming and unfamiliar – or only recently familiar- ideas on modes of thought, modernist reformist in the lands of the ottoman empire strove to reach an accomodation, an a double accomodation at that: salvaging the intellectual credibility of the Qur'ān and other foundational text on the one hand, and adopting the inevitable tropes and values of modernity on the other. See: Aziz al-Azmeh, *Islams and Modernities*, p. 101.

community which will absolve them from jurist ( $fuq\bar{a}h\bar{a}$ ) authorities, because of this reason reformists invite Muslims to return to the Qur'ān and Sunna.

Islam as a religion can be seen as movement for designing Islam as the source of power and social controlling.<sup>5</sup> In this case, the theme of reformist and its second source (Sunna) to be discussed. The Significance of reformist movements based on their opinion on prophetic period and *salaf* as a *par excellence* phase of Islam. They also admitted it as an ideal pattern. Although, modern reformism<sup>6</sup> not only based on that case, but also as responds to the increasing of challenge from Western to the Muslim world. Many cases have been debated since classical era, begin from the rule of the Qur'ān and Sunna through of heresy (*bid'a*) and unquestioning acceptance of traditional religious interpretations (*taqlīd*). It is a modern reformism focus which formed inheritance and rough matters of disputation.<sup>7</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Clifford Geertz see that movements as an effort for making Islam as a "universal" thing, in standard, unchanged, and commonly integrated into ritual system and belief...are not only made a religion but also as life way completely and comprehensively, see: Aziz Talbani, "Pedagogy, Power, And Discourse: Transformation of Islamic Education" in *Keilmuan Integrasi dan Interkoneksi Bidang Agama dan Sosial*, Waryono (Ed.) (Yogyakata: Lembaga Penelitian Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga), p.182.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The series of transformation which Muslim societies have undergone since the end of the eighteenth century culminate in the triumph of the modern state and the establishment of a vast process of dismantling of the traditional structures born out of the medieval balance (concomitance with reformism agenda). In one ways, as Abdel Majid Charfi points out, secularization is already an established fact in Muslim society today. It is already a fact as regards mentalities and as regard the institutions which define the social and political order. Today no field of practical life is still subject to religious based norms. See: Gema Martin Muňoz, *Islam Modernism and the West: Cultural and Political Relation at the End of Millenium* (London: I.B Tauris Publishers and The Eleni Nakou Foundation, 1990), p. 133.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Thoha Hamim, *Paham Keagamaan Kaum Reformis: Studi Kasus Pemikiran Moenawar Chalil* (Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana, 2000), p. 1.

The reform discourse is inseparable with transformation,<sup>8</sup>modernism<sup>9</sup> and renewal cases. Modernism opposed to medievalism (or traditionalism), that the sovereignty of reason and repudiates. Medieval man could be silenced by the voice of authority and the modern man asks for reasons and explanations even from the greatest authority.<sup>10</sup>

Reformist agenda has been confronting the rejection from traditionalists. They have dialectics argument both of them (reformists and traditonalists). This turbulences always have adressed their arguments to the Qur'ān and Sunna as two origins of Islam. If other studies about reformism is emphasized on political aspects, this study will be aimed to Sunna principles by Muslim scholars indirectly named themselves as a reformist.

The most important that reformism concepts in contemporary Islam associated with modernism ideas, because its one of message has proposed by reformists who have refused to authorities are not independently on ratio consideration. Reformist assumed certain constancy from *shari'a* as a valid even its formulated. This matter caused by historical conditions, social and politic where *Shari'a* rules introduced. For reformists, its constanties made source of discuss and seek rationally, it made integral part of system modern thought.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The action or an instance of transforming, AS Hornby, *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary of Current English* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995), p.1270.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Modern idea or methods in contrast to traditional ones, especially in art or religion, AS Hornby, *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary...* p. 750.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Mazheruddin Shiddiqi, *Modern reformist Thought In The Muslim World* (Delhi: Adam Publishers, 1999), p. 1.

Hence, a reformist on the same time a modernist. According to Reformist, Islam is compatible with rational modern seeking and, furthermore the application of ideas and modern norms into supreme form *shari'a*. Beside it, reformist was a puritanist.<sup>11</sup> His/her doctrines related to Islamic purification.<sup>12</sup> The contemporary understanding of reformist projects can be seen in the writings of Muslim intellectuals in the Muslim World, including two reformists, Moenawwar Chalil and Fazlur Rahman.

Reformists's ideology had been inviting conflicts internally in Indonesian Muslim context.<sup>13</sup> The followers of Indonesian modernism were '*kaum muda*' (youth community). It support to radical change thought and religious practices. The opposite of this movement was '*kaum tua*' (old community) who rejected the radical change by '*kaum muda*' and who would conserve religious tradition in Indonesia. '*Kaum tua*', beleived that the truth learnt by the great scholars in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Puritanist indicated to adherent this ideology, puritan is community which their beliefe followed absolutism and uncompromising, Khalid Abou el-Fadhl related with this case he likes mentioned as a puritan cause its meant intolerance to anypoints of competitive views and its seen pluralistic reality as a contamination form on the genuine of truth. See: A. Rafiq Zainul Mun'im, "Islam Puritan Versus Islam Moderat: Eksplorasi Gagasan Khalid Abou El-Fadl", *Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Ushuluddin*, vol. 7. No. 2 July 2008, p. 168-169

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Thoha Hamim, *Paham Keagamaan Kaum Reformis...*p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Conflict between two biggest organizations in Indonesia who have presented their ideologies, *Muhammadiyya* as organization based reformism forces, and *Nahdhah al-'Ulama* represented traditional organization althought there are others organizations adressed their ideologies to reform in Indonesia context, the crucial one faced by both of ideology, cause of turbulences not only in academic spheres but also conflicts in 'grass root' spheres, an exampled did in South Borneo, several religion practices such as *tahlilan* (ritual for died peoples), *talqin, haulan* and soon, these traditions rejected by *Muhammadiyya* or 'kaum muda' as a heresies (bid'a) tradition even these are syirik (pholyteism). Most of all the practices about traditions assumed (by *Muhammadiyya*) as veneration or 'minta berkah' (bless asking of the priest). NU and Muhammadiyya's conflicts, according to Achmad Fedyani (University of Indonesia antropolog) he has wrote at 1930 occured coupe the mosque of pandulangan Alabio between NU (*Nahdhah al-'Ulama*) and *Muhammadiyya*. See: Mujiburrahman, " Aqidah dan Realitas Keberagaman Masyarakat Banjar", Journal *Tashwīr al-Afkār*, No. 26, october 1997, p. 54-55.

classic and medieval era such as *al-Gazali*, *al-Matūridi* and *al-Asy'ari* in theology, and the *Imām* of *Madhhab* in Islamic law would have not been replaced. The truth, for '*kaum tua*' never changed and research on the Qur'an and Sunna is not only unnecessary but also dangerous. According to *kaum tua* it will make miss-interpretation and mistakes.<sup>14</sup>

The emergence of *Muhammadiyya* and *Persis* (Persatuan Islam) movements in 1912 and 1923 represents the Islamic reformist trend in the early twentieth century. The Islamic religious reforms advocated by these movement encompassed several aspects of life, individual as well as social. However, the primary concern voiced by the reformist was certain theological issues which were essential to the whole movement. Hence, the purpose of the establihment of *Muhammadiyya* was initially to purify Indonesian Islam from local influences and practices and to reformulate Islamic doctrines in the light of modern thought. *Persatuan Islam*, on the other hand, was founded in order to strengthen the faith on the basis of the Qur'ān and the Sunna<sup>15</sup>, and to accelerate the propagation of Islam.<sup>16</sup>

<sup>16</sup> Fauzan Saleh, *Modern Trends in Islamic Theological Discourse in Twentieth Century Indonesia: A Critical Survey* (Leiden: Brill, 2001), p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Howard M. Federspiel, *Persatuan IslamPembaharuan Islam Indonesia Abad XX*, trans. Yudian W. Asmin (Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University press, 1998), p.60.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Persis's understanding on Sunna was focused to *fiqh* nuances in observence of religious duties and *Mu'amala* themes. This matter correlated with background of education, basic of knowledge, basic assumptions (fundamental philosphy) of *Persis* members which held rigidly by them that Muhammad even he spoke Sunnas was on his capacity as a messenger, it implicated all text of Sunnas to law and its universally (according to *Dewan Hisbah of Persis*) can be applied to all place and all time. See: Siti Shobariyah Hawasy, *Metode Pemahaman Hadis Dewan Hisbah Persatuan Islam: Kajian terhadap Keputusan Sidang Dewan Hisbah Persis ke-IV 2002*, Undergraduate Thesis in tafsir and Sunna departement of *Ushuluddin* Faculty of Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University, 2005.

Farichin Chumaidy concludes that the significance of the emergence of the *Nahḍah al-'Ulamā'* for Indonesian Muslim community can be viewed perhaps best from the angle of the orthodox (traditionalist) Muslim group it united them and made them a social force which is regarded as a counterbalance to the existence of the Islamic reformist organizations in Indonesia.<sup>17</sup>

Moenawwar Chalil is among important reformist in Indonesia. His double positions as a chairman of *Majlis 'Ulamā* of *Persis* (persatuan Islam) and member of center *Majlis Tarjih* of *Muhammadiyya* indicate his significant.<sup>18</sup> He also the first writer of *"Kembali Kepada al-Qur'ān dan Sunnah"*<sup>19</sup> (Back to The Qur'ān and Sunna) and his contacs with traditional communities will give different paradigms on Sunna thought.

The second Muslim scholar as an object of this research is Fazlur Rahman as a reformist. According to Rahman, as noted by Wan Mohd, reformist is whoever has optimistic on their positions and their views progressively, among them are; Ibn Ḥazm, Ibn Taymiyya, Muḥammad Ibn 'Abd al-Wahhāb and Rahman.<sup>20</sup> Rahman's approaches was inspired by historical approach developed by orientalists, but Rahman adreessed his critiques to some orientalists who

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Akh. Minhaji, *Ahmad Hassan And Legal Reform In Indonesia (1887-1958)*, (Yogyakarta: Kurnia Kalam Semesta Press, 2001), p.229.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Thoha Hamim, *Paham Keagamaan Kaum Reformis...*p. 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> According to Muh. Tafsir's research, this book included as a popular literature used by IAIN/STAIN and PTAIS since 1970's era. See: Muh. Tafsir, *Kajian Hadis di Indonesia: Sejarah dan Pemikiran* (Ponorogo: STAIN Ponorogo Press, 2007), p. 33-35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> The second category, they really neglectless with their reformism methods and they have intellectual history are not unconstant, this cluster represented by al-Ghazāll. See: Wan Mohd. Nor Wan Daud, "*Fazlur Rahman: Kesan Seorang Murid dan Teman*" *Jurnal 'Ulūmul Qur'ān*.

analyzed Islamic history as "analyzing a body already died." In contrast to orientalist, Rahman offers an approach to Islamic development which is not only historical approach but also what included on that history can be taken for the renewal of thoughts and Islamic movements in modern era.<sup>21</sup>

Rahman occupied many positions during his lifetime. He was an adviser of the Advisory Council of Islamic Ideology, a religious policy-making body in Pakistan which proposed policies for implementation by the Pakistani goverment. Althought Rahman faced strong opposition and finally had to leave Pakistan in 1968, it gave him practical experience of initiating political and legal reform that encouraged him for the rest of his life to advocate for the transformation of intellectual tradition.<sup>22</sup>

The transformation of "Little" tradition can be characterized as the " Orthodoxification" of the tradition, and on the other hand, the modernization of the great tradition.<sup>23</sup> Rahman's agendas from "Little" tradition toward "greater" tradition in pakistan faced to traditionalists resistance. In pakistan context, religion and has to be able to deal with new and dynamic of political ideologies. Those traditions were turned into customs while basis of faith is today becoming

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Mujiburrahman, *Mengindonesiakan Islam: Representasi dan Ideologi* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2008), p. 90.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Meena Sharify-Funk, "Overcoming the Barriers; The Role of critical Islam in Empowering Muslim Women", Paper in Center for the study of Islam and Democracy, Fourth Annual Conference, School of International service American University, Washington, DC, 2003, p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Fauzan Saleh, *Modern Trends in Islamic Theological Discourse in Twentieth Century Indonesia : A Critical Survey*, p. 13.

weak..<sup>24</sup> Rahman understood that Islam must be a solver for many contemporary problems. In his book *Islamic Methodology in History* he describes deteriorations of Muslim societies. He said that for about a century Muslim society has been experiencing the onset. Within its fabric, or tremendous forces let loose by what is generally called "modernity."<sup>25</sup> Rahman worries that Islamic source functions recently, including Sunna.

Islam has rejected foolishness in any forms and patterns. Islam came to make revolution fully for belief, life views, conceptions, realities, new scales from values, binding of fresh morality, motivation transforming. It will open pure process to produce all of changing structures on developing and making  $\overline{Imani}$ societies. It will build ideology of social movement like aimed for *Khilāfah 'alā Minhāj al-Nubuwwah*.<sup>26</sup>

Reformism thinkers on Sunna they gave positive contributions for Islamic reformism in their countries. Moenawwar Chalil and Fazlur Rahman are among reformists who have important rules. Moenawwar Chalil's affiliation to *Majlis 'Ulamā* of *Persis* (Persatuan Islam), member of center *Majlis Tarjīh* of *Muhammadiyya* and secretary of *Lajnah Ahli-Ahli Hadis Indonesia* (the committee of Sunna scholars) illustrate his contribution tolaw products, critiques

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Erwin I.J. Rosenthal, *Islam in the Modern National State* (Cambridge: Cambridge university Press, 1965), p. 200.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Fazlur rahman, *Islamic Methodology in History* (India: Adam publishers, 1994), p. 176.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> H.A. Mukti Ali, *Alam Pikiran Islam Modern di India dan Pakistan* (Bandung: Mizan, 1996), p. 254-255.

(especially to traditionalist customs in Indonesian context), and reformism project.

#### B. Research Questions

Based on the background, this research will answer these following questions:

- 1. What are the main thoughts of Moenawar Chalil's and Fazlur Rahman's on Sunna principles?
- 2. What are the similarities and differences of Moenawar Chalil's and Fazlur Rahman's Sunna principles?
- 3. What are the strengths and weaknesses of Moenawar Chalil's and Fazlur Rahman's Sunna principles?

#### C. Research Objectives

- 1. Objects this research
  - a. To know reformists thought on Sunna comprehensively, particularly

Moenawar Chalil and Fazlur Rahman.

- b. To know the similarities and differences of their Sunna hermeneutic principles.
- c. To know the weaknesses and strengths of their hermeneutic principles.

#### D. Review of Literature

In book of *Modern Reformist thought in The Muslim World* by Mazheruddin Shiddiqi explores about the modernist Muslim reformers, and the intellectual, political social, economic and educational problems faced by Muslim world. Modern civilizations has given birth to new concepts, ideas and theories which have changed the traditional ways of thinking.<sup>27</sup> This book focused on reformist Muslim thinkers and their turbulences with traditionalism, this book generally discussed about modernity and changing which must be changed did by Muslim tradition. Althought, this book has given a general views of reformism projects in Islamic world, its has not given yet specifically and comprehensively of Sunna studies to reformism projects.

Taufik Adnan Amal in his undergraduate thesis (*Islam dan Tantangan Modernitas : Studi atas Pemikiran Hukum Fazlur Rahman*) has focussed on complex controversiality between traditionalist groups and fundamentalist, in the other hand, with modernist groups. And it was appeared based on their struggle to define "Islam" for Pakistan. The essential of " being" or " *Raison d*" *Etre* " of Pakistan was willing of Pakistan Muslim to be able to life fully under Islam guidances. According to Adnan Amal, althought this writting was including one chapter of Sunna conceptions, but this seeking stressed to law thought of Rahman appears based on religious doctrines.<sup>28</sup> If its was focused to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Mazheruddin Shiddiqi, *Modern Reformist thought in The Muslim World* (India : Adam Publisher, 1998), p. 229.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Taufik Adnan Amal, *Islam dan Tantangan Modernitas: Studi atas Pemikiran Hukum Fazlur Rahman* (Bandung: Mizan, 1989), p. 43-44.

law-thought of rahman, my research will seek comprehensively about critical of Rahman reformism agenda based on his thought on Sunna.

In Indonesia context, Akh. Minhaji has wrote about turbulences of reformism movement in Indonesia in his doctoral dissertation (Ahmad Hassan and Islamic Legal Reform in Indonesia (1887-1958)). Based on Minhaji: "there is a perception held not only by scholars in the field but by many Muslim as well that Islamic law in Indoesia is strongly colored by " non-Islamic" local custom (adat). Because, its historically, this notion has given rise to a number of movements which have sought to ensure that religious beliefs and practices be resorted and brought into harmony with the primary sources of Islam the Our'anand Sunna."<sup>29</sup> One of reformist has colored Indonesia reformism disputation, Minhaji's research has decided that Hassan developed a sound, consistent and text-based approach to usul al-Figh that was adopted after his death by his followers and students. In this matter, Minhaji tried to explain reformism movement in Indonesia which was brought by Ahmad Hassan. This matter has determined several Indonesian Muslim scholars. Althought, this research represents Indonesia reformism, but this research more focused to Islamic legal Theory (usul al-figh) Based on this matter, in this case Moenawar Chalil was a reformist in one line with Ahmad Hassan, he represents an Indonesian reformist will be focused about his thought on Sunna and its implication to reformism in Indonesia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Akh. Minhaji, *Ahmad Hassan and Islamic Legal Reform in Indonesia 1887-1958*, (Yogyakarta: Kalam Semesta Press, 2001), p. Xi.

Thoha Hamim, throught his doctoral dissertation at McGill University was translated with tittle (Paham Keagamaan Kaum Reformis : Studi Kasus *Pemikiran Moenawwar Chalil*), as a shape of thought after past reformist. Mattters has made renewal of religion. Based on slogan back to the Qur'an and Sunna as a reformist Chalil rejected *bid'a* practices. Thoha Hamim also has mentioned that Chalil has revitalized and declared to pay attention to Sunna which designed to rebuild direct relations with characteristics of law decisions. Chalil also criticized to falls practices which adressed to Rasulullah. And main thought of Chalil reformism thought is his revisions to understand of basic doctrines and he also corrects traditional religious celebrations to promote *tawhid* conception and purity of faith.<sup>30</sup> Hamim's research, according to him was focused to compromize between traditionalist and reformist in In donesian context who has represented by Chalil on academic area for loosing prejudice both them. And my research, contrary to him, if Hamim has discussed the turbulences both of traditionalists and reformist, Moenawar Chalil's thought will be focused to trace his Sunna hermeneutic and determine aim of Chalil reformism project based on his Sunna thought an sich.

Sutrisno in his writing (*The Works of Fazlur Rahman: A Bibliographical Study*) published on *Hermenia*, multi-discipline journal of Islamic studies. In this paper about Fazlur Rahman, Sutrisno aims to understand and to analyze the concept of epistemology in Fazlur Rahman's thought. Epistemology is understood as the theory of knowledge which issues the matters of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Thoha Hamim, *Paham Keagamaan Kaum Reformis*...p. xi.

knowledge origin, method, approach, classification, validation. Sutrisno in this paper used an approach in disclosing the basically fundamental structure of knowledge.<sup>31</sup>

Rabiatul Azkiyah in his undergraduate thesis (*Kontekstualisasi Hijrah : Suatu Pendekatan Metodologi Penafsiran Fazlur Rahman*), Azkiyah by using methodology approach of Rahman's interpretation which compromised with the historical and sociological aspects in his interpretation scheme. Azkiyah tried to reinterprete historical accidents naturally on effort for understanding reality and dynamics of change nowadays, and he also said that general principles of the Qur'an must be counted in contemporary legislation for keeping up meaning and its spirit on giving solutions in mutual accord today.<sup>32</sup>

#### E. Research Method

This is a qualitative research which focuses on bibliographical studies or library research. It will explain about reformist thoughts on Sunna.

# 1. Sources of Data SLAMIC UNIVERSITY

Sources of data in this research will include the primary and the secondary datas. The primary data is *Kembali Kepada Al-Qur'an dan Sunnah* by Moenawwar Chalil and *Islamic Methodology in History* by Fazlur Rahman, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Sutrisno, *Epistemologi Pemikiran Fazlur Rahman*, in *Hermenia*, multi-discipline Journal of Islamic Studies, Vol. 1, No. 1, January-June, 2002. Post Graduate of Sunan Kalijag Islamic State University

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Rabiatul Azkiyah, *Kontekstualisasi Hijrah: Suatu Pendekatan Metodologi Penafsiran Fazlur Rahman*, Undergraduate Thesis in Tafsir and Hadith Departement of *Ushuluddin* Faculty of Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University, 1999.

secondary data include *Paham Keagamaan Kaum Reformis* by Thoha Hamim and *Desain Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman Dalam Pemikiran Hermeneutika Fazlur Rahman* by Ilyas Supena.

#### 2. Method of Data Collection

The method for collecting the datas in this research is documentation method. Documentation means is collecting and making note to works which has written by scholars prominents, in this case is Chalil's and Rahman's works related to their thoughts, or writing by others which related to the prominents thought.<sup>33</sup>

#### 3. Data Analysis Techniques

Once all the data are collected from several sources, the next step is the process of data analysis. The process of data analysis is the process of organizing and sorting the data into patterns, categories, and descriptions on the basic unit in order to discover themes. Working hypotheses can be formulated as suggested by the data.<sup>34</sup> In order to accumulate data into qualitative techniques, the analyses will include:

a. Historical continuity, which is the method to describe the life history character, education, development of ideas, influences it receives, the socio-political circumstances of times that experienced by the characters, as well as study earlier.<sup>35</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Arief Furchan and Agus Maimun, S*tudi Tokoh Metode Penelitian Mengenai Tokoh* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2005), p. 54.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Lexi J. Moleong, *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif* (Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya, 2002), pp. 103.

b. Taxonomic analysis, the analysis is centered on a specific theme that serves to illustrate the problems that became the target of study, then track him down and explain it in more deeply.<sup>36</sup>

c. Interpretation, which is the method to understand the thoughts of the characters Moenawwar Chalil and Fazlur Rahmman, in this case about reformist thought on Sunna, to capture the intended figure explanation.<sup>37</sup>

d. Comparison, the scholars will be compared proportionally. It will reduce the similarities, differences, strengths and weaknesses both of scholars.

#### 4. Research Approach

This research will use Hassan Hanafi's hermeneutical approach that includes three principal hermeneutical problems: 1) essences of the thought, 2) methods have used (by reformists) to understand the text, 3) how the understanding based on horizons from audiens who was an object of the text <sup>38</sup> have worked by reformists (Chalil and Rahman) on the Sunna thought. It used to classify the reformist's thought.

<sup>35</sup> Anton Bakker and Achmad Chairiz Zubair, *Metodologi Penelitian Filsafat* (Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 1990), pp. 64.

<sup>36</sup> Arif Furchan and Agus Maimun, *Studi Tokoh, Metode Penelitian Mengenai Tokoh* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2005), pp. 65-67.

<sup>37</sup> Anton Bakker and Achmad Chairiz Zubair, *Metodologi Penelitian*. pp. 63.

<sup>38</sup> Musahadi Ham, *Evolusi Konsep Sunnah: Implikasinya Pada Perkembangan Hukum Islam* (Semarang: Aneka Ilmu, 2000), p.140. This hermeneutical approach inspired by Hasan Hanafi who will relate between counsciousness to the object with three principles steps: *historical counsciousness (al-Shu'ūr al-Ta'ammuliy)*, this step determines the originality the text and certainty, and *eidetic counsciousness (al-Shu'ūr al-Nazarī)* will show the meaning of the texts and make it rationally, and *practical counsciousness (al-Shu'ūr al-Yamalī)* in using the meaning as basic theories for practical applications.

#### F. Research Outline

This research will consist of five chapters:

Chapter one is introduction that consist of background, statement problem, object and significance, review of literature, method of research and systematic of Inquiry. This chapter will be used as basic of research and determines aim of this research. As general view about background will give explanation of problems of this research, not only to know what are the background but also this chapter contains a reason of research choosing.

Chapter two will describe reformists biographical sketch. This chapter will explain their *socio-cultural* background, scholarly career, scholarly works and social organizations activities. This biographical sketch is important for this research because it determines their thought conceptions.

Chapter three is focused specially on general studies about reformist, definition and its rules in Sunna discourse. This explanation is important to know the general overview that reformist issue motivates the social changing, especially in its relation to Islamic basic text.

Chapter four will discuss their thought, especially on their hermeneutical conceptions about Sunna, including: historical, eidetic, and practical criticism on understanding Sunna. This chapter is main study of Moenawwar Chalil's and Fazlur Rahman's thought on Sunna principles. With the hermeneutical studies, this chapter will seek an original thought on their Sunna principles as an original thought both of them and also researcher will search some differences and similarities, strengths and weaknesses between Moenawwar Chalil and Fazlur Rahman. With the logics of comparison researcher will compare proportionally based on their original principles on Sunna which built by scholars.

Chapter five is the conclusion. In this chapter researcher will answer the research questions and also recommendations based on research.



#### CHAPTER V

#### CONCLUSION

#### A. CONCLUSION

This research will answer the statements of problem based on approach of this research. Researcher got the following conclusions:

- 1. Chalil's thought on Sunna is dominated by Islamic jurisprudence perspectives. His reform ideas are addressed to redesign the legal characters based on Sunna. Chalil believes that Sunna and its mission to advance Islam can be achieved by conserving the essences of Sunna. He compares the *riwāyahs* with the Qur'ān to prove coherency between Qur'ān and Sunna. In the other hand, Fazlur Rahman believes that the prophetic Sunna must be interpreted in line with modernity without neglecting the historical factors. Rahman tries to relate the continuity of history on understanding the Sunna.
- 2. The simmilarity of Chalil and Rahman do not focuss on *sanad* criticism. They try to put Sunna in the highest position and applicable in the Muslim societies. Chalil and Rahman are different on their method to understand the Sunna. Chalil understands Sunna based on textual approach method by letting texts explains each other. It is different from Rahman who contextualizes the Sunna rationally using interdisciplinary approaches.

3. Chalil is successful in producing *fiqh al-Nabawī* althought without integrating modern sciences comprehensivelly. It is Chalil's weakness when compared to Rahman who contextualizes using methodic steps. With this method, Rahman will find the ideal-moral of Sunna although there is no certain limitations in combining between history and modernity.

#### **B. RECOMMENDATION**

The present crisis in Islamic thought is more alarming than ever before. Admittedly, the long-standing isolation previously mentioned has resulted in incompetence and superficiality of thought, but it is not the main cause of the crisis. Much more to the point is the inability of our thinkers to measure the extent of change that has taken place in the realm of knowledge, culture, and civilization in the modern world. There is also parallel inability to locate the point of strength in the source of Islamic knowledge and to learn from past experience.

The best answer to the crisis in Islam is the Islamic reformist movement to reapply Islam based on Islam sources, on this case Sunna must be developed to realize Islam progressively in facing the dynamics of change. In this matter, researcher offers "Reformology" to reapply idealmoral of Islam without neglecting Islamic historicity, locus condition and Islamic treasure on facing modernity. This comparative study of reformists has shown its capacities for readjustment and self-correction, and there are indications that it is continuing to develop with the intellectual challenges of new times.



#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- 'Abbādī, 'Abd Allāh bin Sa'īd Muḥammad. *Iḍāh al-Qawā'id al-Fiqhiyyah*. Surabaya: Maktabah al-Hidāyah, 1410 H.
- Abbas, Hasjim. *Kritik Matan Hadis Versi Muhadditsin dan Fuqaha*. Yogyakarta: Teras, 2004.
- Abū Sulaymān, 'Abdul Hamīd A.. *Islamization of Knowledge: A New Approach Toward Reform of Contemporary Knowledge*, in "Islam: Source and Purpose of Knowledge" the proceedings and selected papers of second conference on Islamization of Knowledge 1402 AH/ 1982 AC.Virginia: Herndon, 1988.
- Abū Zahw, Muḥammad Muḥammad. *Al-Ḥadīth wa al-Muḥaddithūn: 'Ināyah al-Ummah al-Islāmiyyah bi al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyyah*. Cairo: Dār al-Kitāb al-'Arabī, 1984.
- A'la, Abd. Dari Neomodernisme ke islam Liberal. Jakarta: Paramadina, 2003.
- Ali, A. Mukti. *Alam Pikiran Islam Modern di India dan Pakistan*. Bandung: Mizan, 1996.
- Ali, As'ad Sa'id. *Negara Pancasila: Jalan Kemaslahatan Berbangsa*.Jakarta: Pustaka LP3ES Indonesia, 2009.
- Amal, Taufik Adnan. Islam dan Tantangan Modernitas: Studi atas Pemikiran Hukum Fazlur Rahman. Bandung: Mizan, 1989.
- Arkoun, Mohammed. Islam: To Reform or to Subvert?. London: Sagi Books, 2006.
- Ash-Shiddieqy, T.M. Hasbi. *Sejarah dan Pengantar Ilmu Hadits*. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1980.
- Assyaukani, Luthfi. "Islamic reform Movement in Indonesia And Beyond Progress And Regress" in *Journal of Indonesian Islam*. Vol. 2, Number. 1, Surabaya: Lembaga dan Studi Agama dan Sosial IAIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, 2008.
- Al-Ațțār, 'Abd al-Nāșir. '*Ulūm al-Sunnah wa Dustūr li al-Ummah.* Cairo: Maktabah al-Wahbah, 1987.

- Azkiyah, Rabiatul. Kontekstualisasi Hijrah: Suatu Pendekatan Metodologi Penafsiran Fazlur Rahman, Undergraduate Thesis in Tafsir and Hadith Departement of Ushuluddin Faculty of Sunan Kalijaga Islamic State University, 1999.
- Al-Azmeh, Aziz. Islams and Modernities. New York: Verso, 1996.
- Azra, Azyumardi. Jaringan Ulama Timur Tengah XVII dan XVII: Melacak Akarakar Pembaruan Pemikiran Islam di Indonesia. Bandung: Mizan,1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Renaisans Islam Asia Tenggara: Sejarah Wacana dan Kekuasaan.* Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2006.
- Al-Bāhī, Muḥammad. *al-Fikr al-Islām al-Hadith Wa Sirāṭuhu Bi al-Isti'mār al-Gharbī*. Trans. Su'adi Sa'ad. Jakarta: Pustaka Panjimas.
- Baidowi, Ahmad, *Meraih Prestasi di Perguruan Tinggi*. Yogyakarta: Jurusan Tafsir Hadis Fakultas Ushuluddin, 2009.
- Berg, Herbert. The Development of Exegesis in Early Islam: The Authenticity of Muslim Literature from the Formative Period. Great Britain: Curzon Press, 2002.
- Burton, John. *The Sources of Islamic Law: Islamic Theories of Abrogation*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1990.
- Chalil, Moenawar. Kembali Kepada Al-Qur'an dan Sunnah. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1977.

. Definisi dan Sendi Agama. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1970.

. Nilai Wanita. Ramadhani: Solo, 1984.

- Daud, Wan Mohd. Nor Wan "Fazlur Rahman: Kesan Seorang Murid dan Teman" Jurnal 'Ulūmul Qur'ān.
- Dhofier, Zamakhsyari. *Tradisi pesantren Studi tentang pandangan Hidup Kyai.* Jakarta: LP3S, 1985.
- Esha, Muhammad In'am. *Rethinking Kalam Sejarah Sosial Pengetahuan Islam, Mencermati Dinamika dan Aras Perkembangan Kalam Islam Kontemporer.* Yogyakarta: eLSAQ, 2006.

- Faiz, Fahruddin. "Perkelahian Pemaknaan Seputar Jargon Kembali Kepada Al-Qur'an dan Hadis" in *Esensia: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu* Ushuluddin. Vol. 5, No. 1. Yogyakarta: IAIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2004.
- Federspiel, Howard M. Persatuan IslamPembaharuan Islam Indonesia Abad XX. Trans. Yudian W. Asmin. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University press, 1998.
- Fealy, Greg. Ijtihad Politik Ulama: Sejarah NU 1952-1967. Yogyakarta: Lkis, 2009.
- Furchan, Arief and Maimun, Agus. S*tudi Tokoh Metode Penelitian Mengenai* Tokoh. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2005.
- Gadamer, Hans Georg. Truth and Method. New York: Seaburry Press, 1975.
- Gibb, H.A.R. *Aliran-Aliran Moderen Dalam Islam.* Trans. Machnun Huseyn. Jakarta: Rajawali Press, 1993.

\_\_\_\_. *Wajhah al-Islām: Nazhra<mark>h fi</mark> al-Ḥarakāt al-Ḥadīthah fi al-'Ālam al-Islāmī*. Cairo: Maṭba'ah al-Islāmiyyah.

- Grolier Incorporated, *The New Grolier Webster International Dictionary of The* English Language.1974
- Ham, Musahadi. *Evolusi Konsep Sunnah: Implikasinya Pada Perkembangan Hukum Islam*. Semarang: Aneka Ilmu, 2000.

. Hermeneutika Hadis-Hadis Hukum: Mempertimbangkan Gagasan Fazlur Rahman. Semarang: Walisongo Press, 2009.

Hamim, Thoha. "Moenawwar Chalil's Reformist Thought: A study of An Indonesian Religious Scholar (1908-1961)." A Dissertation Submitted to The Faculty of Graduate studies and Research in Partial fulfilment of the requirements For The Degree of Doctor of Philosophy Institute of islamic studies. Montreal: Mc Gill University, 1996.

\_\_\_. *Paham Keagamaan Kaum Reformis: Studi Kasus Pemikiran Moenawar Chalil*. Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana, 2000.

Hanafi, Hasan. *Hiṣār al-Zamān: al-Maḍi wa al-Mustaqbal " 'Ulūm."* Cairo: Markaz al-Kitāb li al-Nashr, 2006.

\_\_\_\_. *Al-Turāth wa al-Tajdīd: Mawqifunā min al-Turāth al-Qadīm.* Cairo: Muassasah al-Jāmi'iyyah li al-Dirāsāt wa al-Tawzī', 1992.

- Hardiman, F. Budi. *Kritik Ideologi: Menyingkap Pertautan Pengetahuan dan Kepentingan Bersama Jurgen Habermas.* Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 2009.
- Hasan, Muhammad Tholchah. *Islam dalam perspektif Sosio Kultural*. Jakarta: Lantabora Press, 2000.
- Hawasy, Siti Shobariyah. Metode Pemahaman Hadis Dewan Hisbah Persatuan Islam: Kajian terhadap Keputusan Sidang Dewan Hisbah Persis ke-IV 2002, Undergraduate Thesis in tafsir and sunna departement of Ushuluddin Faculty of Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University, 2005.
- Hornby, AS. Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary of Current English. New York: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Idris, Mardjoko. Kebangkitan Intelektualisme di Mesir: Studi Biografi dan Pemikiran Thoha Husayn. Yogyakarta: Teras, 2008.
- Ismail, M. Syuhudi. *Hadis Nabi Yang Tekstual dan Kontekstual: Tela'ah Ma'ani al-Hadits tentang Ajaran Islam yang Universal, Temporal, dan Lokal.* Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1994.
- Al-Jābirī, Muḥammad 'Ābid. Wajhah al-Nazhr: Nahwa I'ādah Binā' Qaḍāya al-Fikr al-'Arabī al-Mu'āşir. Beirut: Markaz Dirāsāt al-Waḥdah al-'Arabiyyah, 2004.
- Jurdi, Syarifuddin. Pemikiran Politik Islam Indonesia: Pertautan Negara, Khilafah, Masyarakat Madani dan Demokrasi. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2008.
- Juynboll, G.H.A. Kontroversi Hadis di Mesir, trans. Ilyas Hasan. Bandung: Mizan, 1999.
- Khalāf, 'Abd al-wahhāb. 'Ilm Ushūl al-Fiqh. Kairo: Dar al-Qalām, 1947.
- Al-Khātīb, 'Ajjāj *Uşūl al-Ḥadith 'Ulūmuhu wa Muṣṭalahuhu*. Beirut: Dār al-Fikr, 2006.
- Al-Khūli, Amin. *Manāhij al-Tajdīd fi al-Nahw wa al-Balaghah wa al-Tafsīr wa al-Adab*. Beirut: Dār al-Kutub.
- Kurdi, et.al. *Hermeneutika Al-Qur'an dan Hadis* (Yogyakarta: eLSAQ Press, 2010.

- Lyons, David. *Ethics and the Rule of Law*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984.
- Ma'Arif, A. Syafi'i. *Peta Bumi Intellektualisme Islam di Indonesia*. Bandung: Mizan, 1993.
- Mājah, Ibn. *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, Chapter 12, *al-Maktabah al-Shāmilah*. Solo: Pustaka Ridwana, 2004).
- Mahfūz, Najib. Hawl al-'Ilm wa al-'Amal. Cairo: Dar al-Misriyyah, 1996.
- Message of Fazlur Rahman, M. Yahya Birt, 27/06/96.
- Muchsin, Misri A. Filsafat Sejarah dalam Islam. Yogyakarta: Ar-Ruzz, 2002.
- Mujiburrahman, "Aqidah dan Realitas Keberagaman Masyarakat Banjar", Journal *Tashwir al-Afkār*, No. 26. 1997.
  - \_\_\_\_\_. Mengindonesiakan Islam: Representasi dan Ideologi Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2008.
- Minhaji, Akh. *Ahmad Hassan And Legal Reform In Indonesia (1887-1958)*. Yogyakarta: Kurnia Kalam Semesta Press, 2001.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Islamic Law and Local Tradition: A Socio-Historical Approach Yogyakarta: Kurnia Kalam Semesta, 2008.
- MS,Suwardi. Dari Melayu Ke Indonesia : Peranan Kebuudayaan Melayu dalam Memperkokoh Identitas dan Jati Diri Bangsa. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2008.
- Mulyati,Sri. *Tasawuf Nusantara: Rangkaian Mutiara Sufi Terkemuka.* Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group, 2006.
- Mun'im, A. Rafiq Zainul. "Islam Puritan Versus Islam Moderat: Eksplorasi Gagasan Khalid Abou El-Fadl", *Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Ushuluddin*, vol. 7. No. 2. July 2008.
- Munip, Abdul. *Transmisi Pengetahuan Timur Tengah ke Indonesia: Studi tentang Penerjemahan Buku Berbahasa Arab di Indonesia 1950-2004*. Yogyakarta: Bidang Akademik UIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2008.

- Muňoz, Gema Martin. *Islam Modernism and the West: Cultural and Political Relation at the End of Millenium.* London: I.B Tauris Publishers and The Eleni Nakou Foundation, 1990.
- Nasr, Seyyed Hossein. "Decadence, Deviation and Renaissance in the Context of Contemporary *Islani*", in *Islamic Prespectives: Studies in Honour of Mawlānā Abul A'lā Mawdūdi*. Delhi: Markazi Maktaba Islami, 1979.

Nūr al-Din 'Itr. Manhaj al-Naqd fi 'Ulūm al-Hadith Beirut: Dār al-Fikr, 1997.

O'Leary, Zina. *The Essential Guide to Doing Research*. New Delhi: Sage Publications, 2007.

Prakosa, Heru. *Fazlur Rahman and His Qur'anic Hermeneutics*. Long Essay Presented in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for Obtaining the Master of of Religion Studies, Oxford University, 2001.

Pranowo, Bambang. Memahami Islam Jawa. (Jakarta: Pustaka Alvabet, 2009.

Qardhawi, Yusuf. Sunnah Rasul Sumber Ilmu Pengetahuan dan Peradaban, trans. 'Abdul Hayyie al-Kattanie and Abduh Zulfidar (Jakarta: Gema Insani Press, 1988.

\_\_\_\_\_. *Bagaimana Memahami Hadis Nabi SAW*. Trans. Muhammad Al-Baqir. Bandung: Karisma, 1993.

- Rahim, Abdur. *The Principles of Islamic Jurisprudence: According to the Hanafi, Māliki, Shafi'i and Hambalī schools.* New Delhi: Kitab Bhavan, 1994.
- Rahman, Fazlur. *The Impact of Modernity*, in *Islamic Studies, Journal of the Islamic Research Institute, Pakistan.* Vol. V, No.2, June 1966.

\_\_\_\_\_.*Islam and Modernity: Transformation of an Intellectual Tradition.* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1982.

- . Islamic Methodology in History. India: Adam publishers, 1994.
- . Islam . 2nd edition. Chicago: the University of Chicago Press, 1979.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Islamic Modernism : Its Scope, Method And Alternatives", in *International Journal of Middle East Studies*. Vol.1. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Currents of Religious Thought in Pakistan" in *Journal of Islamic Studies*, Vol. 7. Montreal: Montreal University, 1960.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Law and Ethics in Islam" in *South Asian Politis and Religion* Donald Eugene Smith (ed.). Princenton: Princenton University press, 1966.

- Rashid, Daud. *Al-Sunnah fi Indūnīsiya: Bayn Anshārihā wa Khuṣūmihā*. Jakarta: Usamah Press, 2001.
- Rihhāl, Husayn. Ishkāliyyāt al-Tajdīd: Dirāsah fi Dau' 'Ilm Ijtimā' al-Ma'rifah. Beirut: Dār al-Hādī, 2004.
- Roibin, *Relasi Agama dan Budaya Masyarakat Kontemporer*. Malang: UIN Malang Press, 2009.
- Ropi, Ismatu and Kusmana, *Belajar Islam di Timur Tengah.* Jakarta: Departemen Agama.
- Rosenthal, Erwin I.J. *Islam in the Modern National State*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1965.
- Saeed, Abdullah. "Fazlur Rahman: "A Framework for interpreting the ethicolegal content of the Qur'an." Suha Taji-Farouki (ed.), Modern Muslim Intellectuals and The Qur'an. London: Oxford University Press, 2004.
- Sait, Siraj and Lim, Hilary. Land, Law and Islam: property and Human Rights in the Muslim World. London: Zed Books, 2006.
- Saleh, Fauzan. Modern Trends in Islamic Theological Discourse in Twentieth Century Indonesia : A Critical Survey. Leiden: Brill, 2001.
- Sazali, Muhammadiyyah dan Masyarakat Madani: Independensi Rasionalitas dan Pluralisme. Jakarta: PSAP, 2005.
- Setiawan, Nur Kholis. Akar-akar pemikiran Progressif dalam Kajian Al-Qur'ān Yogyakarta: eLSAQ Press, 2008.
- Al-Shāțibi, Abū Ishāq. *Al-Muwāfaqāt fī Uṣūl al-Shārī'ah*. Chapter II. Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 2003.
- Sharify-Funk, Meena "Overcoming the Barriers; The Role of critical Islam in Empowering Muslim Women", Paper in *Center for The Study of Islam and Democracy Fourth Annual Conference*. School of International service American University, Washington DC, 2003.
- Al-Sibā'i, Mustafā. *Sunnah Dan Perkembangan Dalam Penetapan Hukum Islam: Sebuah Pembelaan Kaum Sunni.* Trans. Nurcholish Madjid. Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1991.

- Al-Sijistānī, Abū Dāwud. Sunan Abī Dāwud. Chapter 4, al-Maktabah al-Shāmilah. Solo: Pustaka Ridwana, 2004.
- Smith, Donald Eugene. (ed.), *South Asian Politics and Religion*. Princenton: Pricenton University Press, 1966.
- Supena, Ilyas. Desain Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman dalam Pemikiran Hermeneutika Fazlur Rahman. Semarang: Walisongo Press, 2008.
- Sutrisno, "Epistemologi Pemikiran Fazlur Rahman." in Hermenia: Multidiscipline Journal of Islamic Studies. Vol. 1, No. 1. Post Graduate of Sunan Kalijaga Islamic State University, 2002.
- Sutrisno, Fazlur Rahman: Kajian Terhadap Metode, Epistemologi dan Sistem Pendidikan. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2006.
- Al-Ṣuyūṭī, Jalāl al-Dīn. *Jāmi' al-Ahādīth*. Chapter 10, *al-Maktabah al-Shāmilah*. Solo: Pustaka Ridwana, 2004.
  - \_\_\_\_\_. *Musnad Ahmad.* Chapter 4, *al-Maktabah al-Shāmilah*. Solo: Pustaka Ridwana, 2004.

\_\_\_\_\_. *al-Jāmi' al-Kabīr*. Chapter 1, *al-Maktabah al-Shāmilah*. Solo: Pustaka Ridwana, 2004.

- Syamsuddin, Sahiron. (ed.). *Metodologi Penelitian living Qur'an dan Hadis*, Yogyakarta: Teras, 2007.
- Țahhān, Mahmūd. Taysīr al-Muștalah al-Hadith. Surabaya: al-Hidayah, 1980.
- Tafsir, Muh. Kajian Hadis Di Indonesia: Sejarah dan Pemikiran. Ponorogo: STAIN Ponorogo Press, 2007.
- Tahir, Lukman S. " Memahami Matan Hadis Lewat Pendekatan Hermeneutika" in *Hermenia:Jurnal Kajian Islam Interdisipliner*, Vol.1, Number.1, January-June, IAIN Sunan Kalijaga post graduate program, 2002.
- Talbani, Aziz. "Pedagogy, Power, And Discourse: Transformation of Islamic Education" in *Keilmuan Integrasi dan Interkoneksi Bidang Agama dan Sosial*, Waryono (Ed.) Yogyakata: Lembaga Penelitian Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga.

- Tibi, Bassam *Islam and the Cultural Accomodation of Social Change*. Oxford: Westview Press, 1991.
- Tim Dosen Fakultas Ushuluddin Jurusan Tafsir Hadis UIN Sunan Kalijaga, *Studi Kitab Hadis*. Yogyakarta: Teras, 2003.
- Tim penyusun Pusat Kamus Bahasa. Kamus Bahasa Indonesia. Jakarta: Pusat Bahasa, 2008.
- Al- Tirmidhī, *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, Chapter 10, *al-Maktabah al-Shāmilah*, (Solo: Pustaka Ridwana, 2004.
- Triwulan, Titik and Efendi, Jonaedi. *Membaca Peta Politik Nahdlatul Ulama: Sketsa politik Kiai dan Perlawanan Kaum Muda NU.* Jakarta: Lintas Pustaka, 2008.
- Usmani, Justice Muhammad Taqi. *The Authority of Sunnah*. New Delhi: Kitab Bhavan.
- VikØr, Knut. *Between God and Sultan: A History of Islamic Law.* London: Hurst and Company, 1988.
- Wahyudi, Jarot. "The Works of Fazlur Rahman: A Bibliographical Study" in Mukaddimah: Journal of Islamic Studies, No. 18. Sunan Kalijaga Islamic State University of Yogyakarta, 2005.
- Wahyudi, Yudian. Dinamika Politik "Kembali kepada Al-Qur'ān dan Sunnah" di Mesir, Maroko dan Indonesia. Yogyakarta: Nawesea Press, 2010.
  - \_\_\_\_. Islam: Percikan Sejarah, Filsafat, Politik, Hukum dan Pendidikan. Yogyakarta: Nawasea Press, 2010.
- Wheeler, Brannon M. *Applying the Canon in Islam.* New York: State University of New York Press, 1996.
- Zuhri, Muh. Hukum Islam dalam Lintasan Sejarah. Jakarta: Rajagrapindo, 1996.
- Zuhri, Studi Islam Kontemporer dalam Perspektif Sosiologi Pengetahuan: Telaah Pemikiran Fazlur Rahman dan Mohammed Arkoun, A Dissertation Submitted to The Faculty of Islamic Studies and Research in Partial Fulfilment of Requirements For the Degree of Doctor. Yogyakarta: UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, 2007.